



EXPEDITIONARY
LEARNING

Grade 6: Module 2A: Unit 2: Lesson 12

Selecting Evidence to Logically Support Claims



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.
Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

- I can cite text-based evidence to support an analysis of literary text. (RL.6.1)
- I can determine a theme based on details in a literary text. (RL.6.2)
- I can write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence. (W.6.1)
- I can produce clear and coherent writing that is appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. (W.6.4)
- With support from peers and adults, I can use a writing process to produce clear and coherent writing. (W.6.5)

Supporting Learning Targets

- I can explain how my evidence supports my claim in a logical way.
- I can skillfully select the best evidence to support my claim about Bud.

Ongoing Assessment

- Rule Sandwich Guide: *Bud, Not Buddy*
- Qualities of a Strong Literary Argument Essay anchor chart

Agenda

1. Opening
 - A. Discussing the Rubric (8 minutes)
 - B. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)
2. Work Time
 - A. Studying the Model Essay: Backward Planning a Body Paragraph (12 minutes)
 - B. Writing: Making a “Rule Sandwich” for *Bud, Not Buddy* Literary Argument Essay (20 minutes)
3. Closing and Assessment
 - A. Debrief: How Have You Skillfully Chosen the Rules That Support Your Claim? (3 minutes)
4. Homework
 - A. Complete your Rule Sandwich Guide for *Bud, Not Buddy* if you did not complete it in class. Continue reading in your independent reading book at home.

Teaching Notes

- In Lessons 12–14, students draft their essays. Each lesson will have a similar structure of direct instruction with the Steve Jobs model essay followed by students’ work on their own essays.
- To get a clear vision of success, students evaluate the model essay against the Literary Argument Essay Rubric to scaffold their writing.
- Part of the Literary Argument Essay Rubric asks students to “skillfully and logically explain how evidence supports ideas.” In this lesson, the focus is on skillful evidence selection, while in Lesson 13 students will focus on skillful explanations through concise and clear language.
- The rule sandwich organizer helps students logically explain their evidence.
- It also scaffolds the writing of the three body paragraphs that students will write in Lesson 13.
- In this lesson, students will use several resources from previous lessons and from Unit 1 as needed.
- In advance: Sort students into writing partners. Place students with those who are working with a similar claim.



Lesson Vocabulary	Materials
logically, skillfully	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Literary Argument Essay Rubric (one per student) • Document camera • Word-catcher (from Unit 1, Lesson 1) • Rule Sandwich Guide: Jobs Speech (one per student) • Model literary argument essay: “Steve Jobs’ Rules to Live By” (from Lesson 9) • Qualities of a Strong Literary Argument Essay anchor chart (from Lesson 9) • Rule Sandwich Guide: <i>Bud, Not Buddy</i> (three per student) • <i>Bud, Not Buddy</i> (book; one per student) • Tracking Bud’s Rules graphic organizer (from Unit 1, Lesson 1) • <i>Bud, Not Buddy</i>: Forming Evidence-Based Claims graphic organizer (from Lesson 11)

Opening	Meeting Students’ Needs
<p>A. Discussing the Rubric (8 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Distribute the Literary Argument Essay Rubric and display it using a document camera. Explain that this is almost exactly the same rubric from Module 1, with one addition. Direct students’ attention to the rubric displayed. • Circle or highlight on the displayed rubric in the Command of Evidence section, “skillfully and logically explain how evidence supports ideas” in Level 4 and “logically explain how evidence supports ideas” in Level 3. • Turn and talk: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * “Discuss with your elbow partner: What does it mean to ‘<i>logically</i> explain’ your evidence?” • Refocus students whole class. Cold call a student to share his/her discussion. Listen for students to say the explanations have to be clear and easy to follow when you read. If students need support with their explanation of logical, ask them to call on another pair of students. If students still need support defining logical after they have called on each other a few rounds, give them the explanation and have them write <i>logical</i> in their word-catcher. • Turn and talk again: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * “Discuss with your elbow partner, what does it mean to ‘<i>skillfully</i> explain’ your evidence?” • Refocus students whole class. Ask for volunteers to share their answers. Consider that <i>skillful</i> might be harder to explain. Listen for students to say that skillful is about selecting the best and most appropriate evidence to support your claim. Again, provide this definition to students if they do not have the answer on their own and tell them to add <i>skillful</i> to their word-catcher. • Explain that they have already worked on skillfully selecting their evidence by revising their graphic organizer in Lesson 11. They will continue this work today while also working on logically explaining their evidence. Direct students to store their Literary Argument Essay Rubric in accordance with your classroom systems for keeping papers. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Using a rubric for self-assessment helps students recognize what they are doing well and determine where they will need more support in order to reach proficiency with the learning targets.



Opening	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>B. Unpacking Learning Targets (3 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Invite a student to read the learning targets aloud while other students follow along:<ul style="list-style-type: none">* "I can explain how my evidence supports my claim in a logical way."* "I can skillfully select the best evidence to support my claim about Bud."• Explain that the first target is about making logical claims. The second target is about skillfully supporting claims. Tell students they will study the Steve Jobs model first and then begin working on their own essay with a writing graphic organizer.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Posting learning targets for students allows them to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.



Work Time	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>A. Studying the Model Essay: Backward Planning a Body Paragraph (12 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Direct students to retrieve the Model literary argument essay: “Steve Jobs’ Rules to Live By” they annotated in Lesson 9. Explain that the three paragraphs in the middle are the body paragraphs. Invite them to skim the second paragraph of the essay to identify if and where the author logically explained the evidence in support of the claim. • Ask: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * “Is this paragraph <i>logical</i>? Please explain your thinking with examples from the paragraph.” If necessary, remind students that logical means “well reasoned” or “making sense.” • Listen for students to explain that is it logical because the author tells you the rule as well as how Jobs used the rule in his life to thrive. • Explain that you want to show them how the paragraph might look in a graphic organizer that they will use to write their own essays. • Display and distribute the Rule Sandwich Guide: Jobs Speech. Read the paragraph at the top aloud. Explain that this is the structure that students will use to explain rules in their essays. It is also a very important part of supporting their argument. • Point out the three parts of the rule sandwich and the example from the model essay. Also, emphasize that there are sentence stems to help them introduce and explain their rules. Explain to students that they will use the quote sandwich to argue how Bud used his rules to survive or thrive. • Read the example in each part of the sandwich that comes from the second paragraph in the Jobs essay. Make connections to what students shared about the second paragraph. Fill in the graphic organizer using the information from the second paragraph, modeling how this paragraph would have looked in its planning stages. • Ask half the class to read the third paragraph and the other half of the class to read the fourth. Direct them to think about which parts of their paragraph would fit into the sandwich. • Refocus the class whole group. Ask a volunteer who read the third paragraph to describe how that paragraph fits into the rule sandwich. Listen for: “The top of the sandwich is the introduction to the rule, ‘At the age of 30 he was fired from Apple, his own company. This led him to discover his second rule.’ The middle of the sandwich is the rule, ‘Love what you do and do what you love.’ And the bottom of the sandwich is the explanation, ‘Jobs overcame being fired and followed that rule. He continued doing what he loved, working on computer systems and starting companies such as Pixar. By choosing to do what he loved, Steve Jobs stayed true to himself and thrived regardless of the tough times.’” • Emphasize that the <i>explanation</i> is where the author shifts gears from the rule to the author’s own thoughts about how Jobs used the rule. • Ask for a volunteer who read the fourth paragraph to share. Listen for: “The top of the sandwich is the introduction to the rule, ‘Even before he survived his first round of cancer, he lived by his third rule.’ The middle of the sandwich is the rule, ‘Live each day as if it was your last.’ And the bottom of the sandwich is the explanation, ‘Jobs followed his heart and intuition with the calligraphy class. He found courage to get over fears of what others thought about him after getting fired from Apple. He knew death was a part of life, and remembering this each day helped him ensure he was doing what he really wanted most days of his life. By living the rule, Jobs thrived.’” • Ask students to turn and talk with each other: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * “What is included in each body paragraph in this model?” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Anchor charts provide a visual cue to students about what to do when you ask them to work independently. They also serve as note-catchers when the class is co-constructing ideas.



Work Time (continued)	Meeting Students' Needs
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • After they have had a chance to discuss, refocus students whole group. Cold call a pair and listen for: “Each body paragraph introduces the rule, says the rule, and explains how Jobs used the rule to thrive.” • Write a generalized paraphrase of that on the Qualities of a Strong Literary Argument Essay anchor chart: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * “Each body paragraph introduces the rule, says the rule, and explains how Bud uses the rule in support of the claim.” <p>B. Writing: Making a “Rule Sandwich” for Bud, Not Buddy Literary Argument Essay (20 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Display and distribute Rule Sandwich Guide: Bud, Not Buddy, three to each student to work on three sandwiches, as scaffolding for three body paragraphs. • Congratulate students on all the thinking they have done about Bud and how he has used his rule in the past several lessons. Invite them to complete three Rule Sandwich Guides for <i>Bud, Not Buddy</i>, one for each rule they have selected. Invite students to use all their resources, such as such as their copies of Bud, Not Buddy, the Bud’s Rules graphic organizer and the Bud, Not Buddy: Forming Evidence-Based Claims graphic organizer. • Ask students to focus on the learning targets as they write: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * “I can explain how my evidence supports my claim in a logical way.’ Our study of the model and the rule sandwich will help you meet this target today.” * “I can skillfully select the best evidence to support my claim about Bud.’ This is similar to the target in Lesson 11, except today you want to make your final selection of evidence to use for your essay.” • Remind students they need to have three rules to support their claim. If it is hard to make the connection between the rule and the claim, then it might not be good text evidence to use. • In this claim, students should use the sandwich as a guide to make sure they are logically supporting their claim just like the Jobs model. Point out that the sandwich provides sentence starters for each section. These sentence starters are there to support students, but it is optional to use them. • Place students in partnerships based on the assessment you completed after Lesson 11. Invite them to support each other in selecting the best evidence and putting it in the sandwich. Tell them that each student is responsible for completing his or her own sandwich. • Circulate and support students as they work. Explicitly praise students as they select an appropriate rule and then develop an introduction to the rule, an explanation for the rule, and the claim. As needed, support students by asking specific questions like: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * “Does Bud’s use of this rule help him survive or thrive? How do you know? Explain your claim.” * “Are there more details you can add from the text and your own thinking to explain your claim?” * “When you look back over your resources, is there a better rule to help you support your claim?” • Refocus students to whole group. Praise them for their focused work. Explain that tomorrow they will use the sandwiches to write their body paragraphs, and ask students to complete their sandwiches for homework if they did not finish them in class. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For students who struggle with following multistep directions, consider having them highlight the explicit steps in this graphic organizer once they have been discussed and identified by the class. • Careful attention to learning targets throughout a lesson engages, supports, and holds students accountable for their learning. Consider revisiting learning targets throughout the lesson so that students can connect their learning with the activity they are working on.



Closing and Assessment	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>A. Debrief: How Have You Skillfully Chosen the Rules That Support Your Claim? (3 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• On the board, write the question:<ul style="list-style-type: none">* “How have you skillfully chosen the rules that support your claim?”• Ask students to discuss in pairs their answers.• Cold call on three to five students to share how to skillfully select a rule. Listen for students to say they needed to explain how Bud used his rule, and that if the explanation didn't make sense they had to either change the rule or change their claim.	
Homework	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>A. Complete your Rule Sandwich Guide for <i>Bud, Not Buddy</i> if you did not complete it in class. Continue reading in your independent reading book at home.</p>	



EXPEDITIONARY
LEARNING

Grade 6: Module 2A: Unit 2: Lesson 12

Supporting Materials



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.
Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



Name:		Date:	
--------------	--	--------------	--

Criteria	CCLS	4	3	2	1	0
CLAIM AND REASONS: The extent to which the essay conveys complex ideas and information clearly and accurately in order to logically support the author’s argument	W.2 R.1–9	—clearly introduces the text and the claim in a manner that is compelling and follows logically from the task and purpose —claim and reasons demonstrate insightful analysis of the text(s)	— clearly introduces the text and the claim in a manner that follows from the task and purpose — claim and reasons demonstrate grade-appropriate analysis of the text(s)	— introduces the text and the claim in a manner that follows generally from the task and purpose — claim and reasons demonstrate a literal comprehension of the text(s)	— introduces the text and the claim in a manner that does not logically follow from the task and purpose — claim and reasons demonstrate little understanding of the text(s)	— claim and reasons demonstrate a lack of comprehension of the text(s) or task



Criteria	CCLS	4	3	2	1	0
COMMAND OF EVIDENCE: The extent to which the essay presents evidence from the provided texts to support argument	W.9 R.1–9	—develops the claim with relevant, well-chosen facts, definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples from the text(s) —sustains the use of varied, relevant evidence —skillfully and logically explains how evidence supports ideas	—develops the claim with relevant facts, definitions, details, quotations, or other information and examples from the text(s) —sustains the use of relevant evidence, with some lack of variety —logically explains how evidence supports ideas	—partially develops the claim of the essay with the use of some textual evidence, some of which may be irrelevant —uses relevant evidence inconsistently —sometimes logically explains how evidence supports ideas	—demonstrates an attempt to use evidence, but develops ideas with only minimal, occasional evidence that is generally invalid or irrelevant —attempts to explain how evidence supports ideas	—provides no evidence or provides evidence that is completely irrelevant —does not explain how evidence supports ideas



Criteria	CCLS	4	3	2	1	0
<p>COHERENCE, ORGANIZATION, AND STYLE: The extent to which the essay logically organizes complex ideas, concepts, and information using formal style and precise language</p>	<p>W.2 R.1–9</p>	<p>—exhibits clear organization, with the skillful use of appropriate and varied transitions to create a unified whole and enhance meaning —establishes and maintains a formal style, using grade-appropriate, stylistically sophisticated language and domain-specific vocabulary with a notable sense of voice —provides a concluding statement or section that is compelling and follows clearly from the claim and reasons presented</p>	<p>—exhibits clear organization, with the use of appropriate transitions to create a unified whole —establishes and maintains a formal style using precise language and domain-specific vocabulary —provides a concluding statement or section that follows from the claim and reasons presented</p>	<p>—exhibits some attempt at organization, with inconsistent use of transitions —establishes but fails to maintain a formal style, with inconsistent use of language and domain-specific vocabulary —provides a concluding statement or section that generally follows the claim and reasons presented</p>	<p>—exhibits little attempt at organization, or attempts to organize are irrelevant to the task —lacks a formal style, using language that is imprecise or inappropriate for the text(s) and task —provides a concluding statement or section that is illogical or unrelated to the claim and reasons presented</p>	<p>—exhibits no evidence of organization —uses language that is predominantly incoherent or copied directly from the text(s) —does not provide a concluding statement or section</p>



Criteria	CCLS	4	3	2	1	0
CONTROL OF CONVENTIONS: The extent to which the essay demonstrates command of the conventions of standard English grammar, usage, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling	W.2 L.1 L.2	—demonstrates grade-appropriate command of conventions, with few errors	—demonstrates grade-appropriate command of conventions, with occasional errors that do not hinder comprehension	—demonstrates emerging command of conventions, with some errors that may hinder comprehension	—demonstrates a lack of command of conventions, with frequent errors that hinder comprehension	—demonstrates minimal command of conventions, making assessment of conventions unreliable



A sandwich is made up of three parts—the bread on top, the filling in the middle, and the bread on the bottom. A “quote sandwich” is similar; it is how you use evidence in an argument essay. First, you introduce a quote by telling your reader where it came from. Then, you include the quote. Lastly, you explain how the quote supports your idea. Read this example of using a quote from the student model essay, “Steve Jobs’ Rules to Live By,” then take a look at the graphic:

“While remembering his Reed College days, Steve Jobs shared his first rule: “You have to trust in something.” ... Jobs followed his rule to trust his gut and enrolled in a calligraphy college course, and that led to the typefaces and spacing used in computers today. Following the rule to trust in something helped Jobs thrive in life because he trusted in himself and didn’t spend energy worrying about the future.”



Introduce the quote.

This includes the “when” of the rule.

Example: *“While remembering his Reed College days, Steve Jobs shared his first rule that,”*

Include the rule.

Make sure to write the number of the rule and punctuate correctly, especially when using quotation marks.

Example: *“You have to trust in something.”*

Analyze the rule.

This is where you explain how the quote supports your claim.

Example: *Jobs followed his rule to trust his gut; he dropped out of college and enrolled in a calligraphy college course, that led to the typefaces and spacing in computers today. Following the rule to trust helped Steve Jobs thrive in life because he trusted in himself and didn’t spend energy worrying about the future.*



A sandwich is made up of three parts—the bread on top, the filling in the middle, and the bread on the bottom. A “quote sandwich” is similar; it is how you use evidence in an argument essay. First, you introduce a quote by telling your reader where it came from. Then, you include the quote. Lastly, you explain how the quote supports your idea. This is where you add your own thoughts to the claim and the text evidence.

Introduce the quote.

This includes the “when” of the rule.

Sample sentence starters for introducing a rule:

In Chapter ___ of the novel, _____.

We are introduced to Rule ___ as Bud _____.

Bud recalls rule number ___ that _____.

Include the rule.

**Make sure to write the number of the rule and punctuate correctly,
especially when using quotation marks.**

Bud’s rule number _____,

“_____”

Analyze the rule.

This is where you explain how the quote supports your claim.

Sample sentence starters for quote analysis:

Using rule number _____ helps Bud _____

By not following rule ___ Bud



A sandwich is made up of three parts—the bread on top, the filling in the middle, and the bread on the bottom. A “quote sandwich” is similar; it is how you use evidence in an argument essay. First, you introduce a quote by telling your reader where it came from. Then, you include the quote. Lastly, you explain how the quote supports your idea. This is where you add your own thoughts to the claim and the text evidence.

Introduce the quote.

This includes the “when” of the rule.

Sample sentence starters for introducing a rule:

In Chapter ___ of the novel, _____.

We are introduced to Rule ___ as Bud _____.

Bud recalls rule number ___ that _____.

Include the rule.

Make sure to write the number of the rule and punctuate correctly, especially when using quotation marks.

Bud’s rule number _____,

“_____”

Analyze the rule.

This is where you explain how the quote supports your claim.

Sample sentence starters for quote analysis:

Using rule number _____ helps Bud _____

By not following rule ___ Bud _____



A sandwich is made up of three parts—the bread on top, the filling in the middle, and the bread on the bottom. A “quote sandwich” is similar; it is how you use evidence in an argument essay. First, you introduce a quote by telling your reader where it came from. Then, you include the quote. Lastly, you explain how the quote supports your idea. This is where you add your own thoughts to the claim and the text evidence.

Introduce the quote.

This includes the “when” of the rule.

Sample sentence starters for introducing a rule:

In Chapter ___ of the novel,

_____.

We are introduced to Rule ___ as Bud _____.

Include the rule.

Make sure to write the number of the rule and punctuate correctly, especially when using quotation marks.

Bud’s rule number _____,

“_____”

Analyze the rule.

This is where you explain how the quote supports your claim.

Sample sentence starters for quote analysis:

Using rule number _____ helps Bud _____

By not following rule ___ Bud