



EXPEDITIONARY  
LEARNING

## **Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 12**

Making a Claim and Advocating Persuasively:  
Preparing for the Practice Fishbowl



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.  
Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



**Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)**

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (SL.8.2a)

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RI.8.9a)

**Supporting Learning Targets**

- I can develop a claim about which food chain I would choose to feed my family—local sustainable or hunter-gatherer—and support it with evidence.
- I can advocate persuasively about my claim.

**Ongoing Assessment**

- Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for excerpt of *Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too*
- Students' comments regarding how to develop a claim
- Developing a Claim graphic organizer



**Making a Claim and Advocating Persuasively:**  
 Preparing for the Practice Fishbowl

Agenda	Teaching Notes
<p>1. Opening</p> <p>A. Review Homework: Evaluating an Argument            Graphic Organizer for Excerpt of <i>Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too</i> by Dr. Mehmet Oz (7 minutes)</p> <p>2. Work Time</p> <p>A. Mini Lesson: Modeling Developing a Claim (13 minutes)</p> <p>B. Independent Work: Developing a Claim to Answer the Question: “Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?” (15 minutes)</p> <p>3. Closing and Assessment</p> <p>A. Partner Share (5 minutes)</p> <p>4. Homework</p> <p>A. Finish your Developing a Claim ticket and be ready to advocate persuasively in the next lesson’s Fishbowl.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This lesson introduces students to what it means to advocate persuasively and how to prepare to advocate persuasively by outlining a claim, points, and evidence. The lesson is designed to prepare students for a practice Fishbowl discussion and a Fishbowl assessment (Part 2 of the end of unit assessment). Note that this lesson addresses both RI and SL standards that NYS added to the CCLS. Both standards require the identical cognitive work for students.</li> <li>• At the beginning of the lesson, students share their homework. Student responses and the answers for teacher reference (see supporting materials) are used to fill in a blank graphic organizer with the class for students to check their thinking, receive feedback and clarification on their ideas, and make revisions.</li> <li>• The question used to model advocating persuasively is similar to the question students advocate persuasively about. The difference is that in the model, you make a claim, choosing between the industrial and organic food chains to feed your family; and when the students work independently, they will make a claim choosing between the local sustainable and hunter-gatherer food chains to best feed their families.</li> <li>• As students prepare their claim, circulate to determine which food chain each student advocates for so you can think about how to group students for the practice Fishbowls in the next lesson. Depending on the size of your class, you need to group your students into two or three groups, and mix up the groups to have students advocating for both food chains in each group to encourage listening to each other, to deepen their thinking and to make their own argument more thoughtful. It also ensures students have counterclaims to respond to.</li> <li>• In advance: Review the Developing a Claim: Model and the Model Fishbowl script to familiarize yourself with the claim you will use to model advocating persuasively and the way it should sound when you present it to the students.</li> <li>• Post: Learning targets.</li> </ul>



**Making a Claim and Advocating Persuasively:**  
Preparing for the Practice Fishbowl

Lesson Vocabulary	Materials
advocate, persuasively	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Excerpt of <i>Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too</i> by Dr. Mehmet Oz (from Lesson 11)</li><li>• Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for excerpt of <i>Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too</i> by Dr. Mehmet Oz (one per student, from Lesson 11 and filled in for homework; one for display)</li><li>• Equity sticks</li><li>• Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for excerpt of <i>Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too</i> by Dr. Mehmet Oz (answers, for teacher reference; see supporting materials)</li><li>• Developing a Claim: Model (one for display)</li><li>• Model Fishbowl Script (for teacher reference)</li><li>• Advocating Persuasively Criteria anchor chart (new; teacher-created; see Work Time A)</li><li>• Developing a Claim (one per student)</li><li>• <i>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</i>, Young Readers Edition (book; one per student)</li><li>• Developing a Claim: Sample Student Response (for teacher reference)</li></ul>



**Making a Claim and Advocating Persuasively:**  
Preparing for the Practice Fishbowl

Opening	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>A. Unpacking Learning Targets (2 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Remind students that for homework they read an Excerpt of <i>Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too</i> by Dr. Mehmet Oz and filled in the Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer for excerpt of <i>Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too</i> by Dr. Mehmet Oz.</li> <li>Consider using <b>equity sticks</b> to select students to share what they recorded on their graphic organizers. Fill out a new Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for excerpt of <i>Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too</i> by Dr. Mehmet Oz, using student answers. Use the <b>Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer for excerpt of <i>Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too</i> by Dr. Mehmet Oz (answers, for teacher reference)</b> as a guide.</li> <li>Invite students to revise their graphic organizers where they think necessary.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Opening the lesson by asking students to share their homework makes students accountable for completing homework. It also gives you the opportunity to monitor which children have not been completing their homework.</li> </ul>
<p><b>B. Unpacking Learning Targets (5 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Review the posted learning targets:           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* “I can develop a claim about which food chain I would choose to feed my family—local sustainable or hunter-gatherer—and support it with evidence.”</li> <li>* “I can advocate persuasively about my claim.”</li> </ul> </li> <li>Circle the word <i>advocate</i>. Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* “What does advocate mean?”</li> </ul> </li> <li>Select volunteers to share their ideas with the whole group. Listen for them to explain that to advocate means to publicly support an idea or cause. Record this definition above the word <i>advocate</i>.</li> <li>Circle the word <i>persuasive</i>. Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* “What does <i>persuasive</i> mean?”</li> </ul> </li> <li>Cold call students to share their responses. Listen for them to explain that to persuade means to convince an audience to take your viewpoint on an issue. Note that speakers persuade us with mostly with <u>what</u> they say, but <u>how</u> they say it is also important. Record this definition above the word <i>persuasive</i>.</li> <li>Describe the end of unit assessment to students. Explain that it has two parts. In the first part, students evaluate an argument for a speech and another excerpt of <i>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</i> using the graphic organizer with which they have been practicing. In the second part, they advocate persuasively about which food chain they would use to feed their family. They will develop their claim and supporting evidence in class in Lesson 14 and for homework, and then participate in a class discussion in the following lesson, where they advocate persuasively for their claim.</li> <li>Tell students they have practiced evaluating arguments; today’s lesson will help them prepare for the advocating persuasively section of the assessment.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Learning targets are a research-based strategy that helps all students, especially challenged learners.</li> <li>Posting learning targets allows students to reference them throughout the lesson to check their understanding. The learning targets also provide a reminder to students and teachers about the intended learning behind a given lesson or activity.</li> <li>Reviewing academic vocabulary words benefits all students developing academic language.</li> </ul>



Work Time	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>A. Mini Lesson: Modeling Developing a Claim (13 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Tell students that you are going to model how to advocate persuasively to answer the question. Make it clear that this is just an example of how to advocate persuasively and that students will answer a similar question, but not the same:<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>* Which food chain would you choose to feed your family, the industrial food chain or the industrial organic food chain?</li></ul></li><li>• Set up the Fishbowl situation with a circle of about eight students on the inside and everyone else sitting on the outside. Display the <b>Developing a Claim: Model</b> and explain that you used this ticket to organize your ideas and now you will use it to advocate persuasively. Refer to the <b>Model Fishbowl Script</b> for how to outline the ideas, but try not to make it sound like you are reading a script, as students will not be writing a script to read when they advocate persuasively. As you model, speak loudly and clearly and make eye contact with students in the room.</li><li>• Ask students to Think-Pair-Share:<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>* “What did you notice?”</li><li>* “What do you wonder?”</li><li>* “How did I advocate persuasively? How did I try to make you think that I chose the best food chain?”</li></ul></li><li>• Select volunteers to share their ideas whole group.</li><li>• Record student responses to the third question on <b>Advocating Persuasively Criteria anchor chart</b>. Ensure the following are included:<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Made a claim.</li><li>• Provide clear reasons for making that claim.</li><li>• Provided strong supporting evidence for reasons from research.</li><li>• Provided sound reasoning.</li><li>• Responded to a claim made by someone else in the Fishbowl.</li></ul></li><li>• Remind students of their work on conflicting viewpoints in the first half of the unit. Explain that a counterclaim is like a conflicting viewpoint—which is a viewpoint that goes against another viewpoint. In the same way, a counterclaim is a claim that goes against another claim. In the Fishbowl model, you listened to the claims of others and argued against someone else’s claim that was different from your own. Remind students of the counterclaim from the Fishbowl model.</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Modeling provides a clear vision of the expectation for students.</li><li>• Anchor charts serve as note-catchers when the class is co-constructing ideas.</li></ul>



**Making a Claim and Advocating Persuasively:**  
Preparing for the Practice Fishbowl

Work Time (continued)	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>B. Independent Work: Developing a Claim to Answer the Question: “Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?” (15 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Distribute <b>Developing a Claim</b> and invite students to read the directions with you.</li> <li>• Refer to the displayed Developing a Claim: Model to help students determine what kind of information they need to record in each box as follows:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The claim is your answer to the question.</li> <li>• Reasons 1 and 2 are your main reasons for making your claim.</li> <li>• Evidence is taken from the book and supports your claim and your reasons for making the claim.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Explain that students will advocate persuasively in a practice Fishbowl in the next lesson, in which they will answer a similar question to the model “Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?” They will use their Food Chain graphic organizers for the local sustainable and hunter-gatherer food chains, and the relevant sections of <i>The Omnivore’s Dilemma</i> to support their claims and fill in the Developing a Claim ticket to help them in the Fishbowl.</li> <li>• Using the Fist to Five protocol, ask students to share how well they understand how to complete the Developing a Claim handout themselves. Notice students who hold up fewer than four fingers and concentrate on assisting them when the class begins to work.</li> <li>• Tell students that as this is a decision for their own family, they will do this independently; however, they can talk to other students if needed, as this isn’t the assessment.</li> <li>• Circulate to assist students in making a claim, determining reasons, and finding evidence. Refer to the <b>Developing a Claim: Sample Student Response</b> for an example of a response. Ask students questions to guide their thinking:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* “Which food chain would you choose?”</li> <li>* “Looking at what you know about both of the food chains, why would you choose that food chain? What two reasons can you give?”</li> <li>* “What evidence can you find in the text to support your reasons?”</li> </ul> </li> <li>• As you circulate, try to discern which of the food chains for which each student advocates, as this will help with groupings in the next lesson.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Providing models of expected work supports all learners, especially challenged learners.</li> </ul>



**Making a Claim and Advocating Persuasively:**  
Preparing for the Practice Fishbowl

Closing and Assessment	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>A. Partner Share (5 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Remind students of the criteria on the Advocating Persuasively Criteria anchor chart.</li><li>• Invite students to pair up and verbally share their claim, reasons, and evidence.</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Having students pair up with someone else to compare their work can help students gain a deeper understanding, learn from peers, and improve their own work.</li></ul>
Homework	Meeting Students' Needs
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Finish your Developing a Claim ticket and be ready to advocate persuasively in the next lesson's Fishbowl.</li></ul>	





EXPEDITIONARY  
LEARNING

# Grade 8: Module 4: Unit 1: Lesson 12

## Supporting Materials



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.  
Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer for Excerpt of *Give (Frozen) Peas a Chance—and Carrots Too* by Dr. Mehmet Oz (Answers, for Teacher Reference)

<b>Evaluating an Argument Graphic Organizer</b>		
<p><b>Author/Speaker’s Claim:</b> <i>Organic food is not democratic because most people can’t afford it. You can still eat healthy food and spend less by buying non-organic food from the regular supermarket.</i></p>		
<b>Relevant Evidence 1</b>	<b>Relevant Evidence 2</b>	<b>Relevant Evidence 3</b>
<p><i>“As with frozen vegetables, fiber and nutrient content usually stay high in canned foods.”</i></p>	<p><i>“Some research indicates that carotenes, which can reduce cancer rates and eye problems, may be more available to the body following the routine heat treatment.”</i></p>	<p><i>“Again and again, canned foods came up the winner, with protein-rich canned pinto beans costing \$1 less per serving than dried, for example, and canned spinach a full 85% cheaper than fresh.”</i></p>
<p><b>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</b> <i>This piece of evidence supports the claim well because it gives a specific example of cheap non-organic food that is good for you.</i></p>	<p><b>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</b> <i>This piece of evidence supports the claim well because it gives another specific example of how cheap non-organic food can be good for you.</i></p>	<p><b>Explain how this piece of evidence is relevant to the claim:</b> <i>This piece of evidence supports the claim well because it shows that canned food is really cheap, but also good for you.</i></p>
<p><b>Did the author provide sufficient evidence? Explain why or why not.</b> <i>The author provides a lot of specific evidence proving that canned food is both affordable and healthy. He doesn’t give much diverse evidence in this excerpt. Maybe that is in the rest of the article. We would need to read the whole article to know if he has enough evidence.</i></p>		
<p><b>Was the reasoning sound? Explain why or why not.</b> <i>Yes, the reasoning is sound. He connected the evidence to his claim in a logical way. It makes sense.</i></p>		



**Model Fishbowl Script**  
(For Teacher Reference)

I would choose food from the industrial organic food chain to feed my family for two important reasons. First, my family struggles with weight and diabetes, so food from the industrial organic food chain is healthier for my family. Industrial food can cause obesity and diabetes. When Michael Pollan describes his meal from McDonald's, which is a meal from the industrial food chain, he says, "Judith, Isaac and I together consumed a total of 4,510 calories at our [McDonald's] lunch, which is about two-thirds of what the three of us should eat in a day." I do not want my family to eat that many calories in one meal. Michael Pollan also points out that organic food is healthier because it contains more nutrients when he says, "The study showed that the organic fruits and vegetables contained higher levels of Vitamin C. They also had a wider range of natural chemicals called polyphenols. Polyphenols are a group of chemicals made by plants that seem to play an important role in human health." I think it would be good for my family's health to eat industrial organic food."

The second reason I would choose industrial organic is that food from the industrial organic food chain is better for the environment. Michael Pollan points out how much better industrial organic is for the environment: "If you include all the farmland growing fruits and vegetables for Earthbound it comes to a total of 25,000 organic acres. The Goodmans estimate that this has eliminated some 270,000 pounds of pesticide and 8 million pounds of petrochemical fertilizer that would otherwise have been applied to those fields." Imagine how many chemicals are eliminated in our environment if we add up all the industrial organic farms in the country! Michael Pollan also says that "Growing corn and nothing but corn has damaged the soil of our farmlands, polluted the water, and threatened the health of all the creatures downstream." My family would really like our food choices to have a positive impact on the environment, so I would choose industrial organic.

I hear you suggesting that the industrial food chain would be better to feed your family because the food is cheaper and your family doesn't have a lot of money to spend on food, but I wonder if the health of your family isn't worth finding money to spend on industrial organic food. If your family eats industrial organic food, they are more likely to be healthy and so will need to spend less on medical bills.



Developing a Claim:  
Model

Name:

Date:

Make a claim based on the question: *Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the industrial food chain or the industrial organic food chain?*

Student Claim			
<i>I would choose the industrial organic food chain to feed my family.</i>			
Reason 1		Reason 2	
<i>My family struggles with weight and diabetes, so food from the industrial organic food chain is healthier for my family.</i>		<i>My family cares about the environment, and food from the industrial organic food chain is better for the environment.</i>	
Evidence A	Evidence B	Evidence A	Evidence B
<i>p. 104 “Judith, Isaac and I together consumed a total of 4,510 calories at our [McDonald’s] lunch, which is about two-thirds of what the three of us should eat in a day.”</i>	<i>p. 134–135 “The study showed that the organic fruits and vegetables contained higher levels of Vitamin C. They also had a wider range of natural chemicals called polyphenols. Polyphenols are a group of chemicals made by plants that seem to play an important role in human health.”</i>	<i>p. 124 “If you include all the farmland growing fruits and vegetables for Earthbound, it comes to a total of 25,000 organic acres. The Goodmans estimate that this has eliminated some 270,000 pounds of pesticide and 8 million pounds of petrochemical fertilizer that would otherwise have been applied to those fields.”</i>	<i>p. 105 “Growing corn and nothing but corn has damaged the soil of our farmlands, polluted the water, and threatened the health of all the creatures downstream.”</i>



Developing a Claim

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (SL.8.2a)

I can use my experiences and my knowledge of language and logic, as well as culture, to think analytically, address problems creatively, and advocate persuasively. (RI.8.9a)

Make a claim based on the question:

***Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?***

Directions:

1. Review your Food Chain graphic organizers for the local sustainable and hunter-gatherer food chains. Use the information you have recorded on your food chain to refer back to the relevant sections of your text.
2. Decide which food chain you would choose to feed your family.
3. Think of two reasons why, based on what you know about those food chains.
4. Find evidence in *The Omnivore’s Dilemma* to support those reasons.

Student Claim			
Reason 1		Reason 2	
Evidence A	Evidence B	Evidence A	Evidence B



**Developing a Claim:**  
Sample Student Response (for Teacher Reference)

Based on the evidence gathered in the Evaluating an Argument graphic organizer and other evidence you have learned over the course of this unit, make a claim based on the question:

*Which food chain would you choose to feed your family—the local sustainable food chain or the hunter-gatherer food chain?*

<b>Student Claim</b>			
<i>I would choose local sustainable to feed my family.</i>			
<b>Reason 1</b>		<b>Reason 2</b>	
<i>Local sustainable grows in ways that preserve the environment.</i>		<i>It is important to me and my family to support local farmers and businesses instead of big corporations.</i>	
<b>Evidence A</b>	<b>Evidence B</b>	<b>Evidence A</b>	<b>Evidence B</b>
<i>“To Joel, sustainable organic farming means using free solar energy instead of fossil fuel energy” (153).</i>	<i>“If local food chains are going to succeed, customers will have to get used to eating [what is in season]” (189).</i>	<i>“Out of every dollar spent on food in this country, ninety-two cents goes to non-farmers. By selling directly to consumers, Joel gets to keep more of that money” (190).</i>	<i>“[Joel Salatin] sees his farm as part of a local food economy. He wants the sale of his eggs and meat to help other local businesses, like small shops and restaurants” (182).</i>